SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS



HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES 1st FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY HALL BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL JUNE 24, 2013 4:00 P.M.

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 1st Floor, City Hall Building, June 24, 2013, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman David Berchelmann

Commissioner Ricardo Fernandez

Commissioner Beatriz Lucero

Commissioner William Helm II

Commissioner Edgar Lopez

Commissioner Randy Brock

The following commissioners were not present:

Commissioner Cesar Gomez

Commissioner John L. Moses

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, City Development Department, Planning Division

Mr. Tony De La Cruz, Planner, City Development Department, Planning Division

Ms. Kristen Hamilton, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

Prior to the Chairman calling the meeting to order, Commissioner Fernandez excused himself from the meeting for a brief period of time. He returned to the meeting at 4:11pm.

Chairman Berchelmann called the meeting to order at 4:04 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC - PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

II. <u>REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION</u>

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. PHAP13-00012: Lot 42 and 43, Block 17, Sunset Heights, City of

El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 837 W. Yandell Historic District: Sunset Heights Property Owner: Jorge Morales Representative: Jorge Morales

Representative District: 8

Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1961

Historic Status: Contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the

construction of a three car detached garage at

the rear yard

Application Filed: 06/03/13 45 Day Expiration: 07/18/13

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guides for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- Design new garages and outbuildings to be compatible with the main structure on the lot in material and design, using existing historic outbuildings in the districts as an example.
- Limit the size and scale of garages and accessory structures so that the integrity of the original structure, or the size of the existing lot, is not compromised or significantly diminished.



Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1 Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3 Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

New garages and accessory buildings should be located in rear yards.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

• New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant sought approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a three car detached garage at the rear yard. She explained that this item was presented to the Commission at the June 10th HLC meeting; however, commissioners moved to postpone the item to the June 24th HLC meeting. The item was postponed as commissioners Master wanted to review the Plan due the applicant's representative/contractor having stated that the property owner was considering adding an additional accessory dwelling unit on top of the garage at a future date.

Ms. Velázquez explained that, prior to today's meeting; staff had spoken to the property owner who explained that he was not ready to present the proposed additional accessory dwelling unit to the Commission as this was something he was considering doing in the remote future. Therefore, the property owner declined to submit any additional site plans. She stated that the property does allow for an additional accessory dwelling unit. Should the property owner decide to construct the additional accessory dwelling unit he will have to submit the design plans to the Commission at that time. In conclusion, the material presented to the Commission at the June 10th meeting is the same material presented by staff today.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any questions of staff or the applicant's representative/contractor.

At the June 10th HLC meeting, Commissioner Helm explained that commissioners made remarks as to the location of the one garage bay and door which faced Yandell rather than the alley. He added that the location was still a concern for him. Commissioner Helm asked whether or not a driveway had been proposed.

Per the site plan, Commissioner Lopez noted the dimensions for the garage had been changed.



Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1 Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

Mr. De La Cruz explained the dimensions were changed due to the criteria regarding existing accessory structures. The dimensions, as shown in the backup material, are the measurements the property owner must abide by in order to obtain the proper permits. Regarding the driveway, currently the property owner does have access to the property via the rear alley. Mr. De La Cruz explained that, in this instance, a hard concrete driveway is not required. He then explained the criteria pertaining to hard concrete and gravel driveways, and excess parking spaces.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if commissioners had any further questions of staff or the applicant's representative/contractor. *There were none.*

Chairman Berchelmann then asked if there was any further discussion amongst the commissioners.

Commissioner Lopez felt the proposed structure was in compliance and that the proposed addition closely resembled the original structure.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Commissioner Lopez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE.

2. PHAP13-00013: Block 1, South Americas Estates Lot 1, City of El

Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 301 S. Americas Historic District: Mission Trail Property Owner: Mimco, Inc.

Representative: PSRBB Commercial Group, Inc.

Representative District: 6

Existing Zoning: C-3/H/C (Commercial/Historic/Condition)

Year Built: N/A Historic Status: N/A

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for new

construction, landscaping, sidewalk installation,

and parking.

Application Filed: 06/10/13 45 Day Expiration: 07/25/13 **Mayor** Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION*** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Mission Trail Historic District Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- Storefront finish should be fabricated from adobe, masonry, or frame covered with stucco.
- For multi-tenant buildings, one sign is allowed for each storefront tenant.
- New structures should respect the integrity of existing buildings. Existing historic structures and streetscapes need to be taken into consideration before designing new infill construction. Setbacks, proportion, rhythm, and building elements should all be addressed.
- Sidewalks within the Mission Trail Historic District are limited. This is due, in part, to the fact that the area is primarily rural. Almost all of the sidewalks are made of concrete; however, other alternatives exist. Brick and stone pavers are available in a wide assortment of colors and patterns and can contribute to the overall enhancement of an area. Exposed stones and pebbles set in concrete are other possibilities to consider as well.
- *Use plantings to screen parking areas.*
- Planting trees with a combination of shrubs and/or ground coverings can greatly enhance Socorro Road. Properly designed landscaping can set the tone for immediate and surrounding areas.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

• New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1 Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3 Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

• Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, an use.

*The modification is that the facades facing Socorro Road have an added feature of a rounded center parapet that is part of the design of the proposed construction so that they will be more in keeping with the historic character of the district.

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant sought approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction, landscaping, sidewalk installation, and parking. She explained that the boundaries of the Mission Trail Historic District extend only 150 feet from the center of Socorro Road on other side. In many cases, many properties or portions of properties are not within the Historic District. Therefore, commissioners will be making a determination whether or not the property located within the historic district *only*, meets criteria.

Chairman Berchelmann wondered why the entire parcel could not be located within the historic district rather than just a small portion of that parcel.

Ms. Velázquez explained perhaps a compromise was reached with the property owners in the Mission Trail Historic District in that the Mission Trail Historic District would only designate the first 150 feet from the center of the road. The applicant has agreed to staff's recommendation of approval with a modification.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any questions of staff.

Commissioner Lopez asked if the store, located directly across the street, was located within the historic district boundaries.

Ms. Velázquez responded that, due to the location, the store is most likely not within the historic district boundaries.

Chairman Berchelmann asked what the historic district landscape requirements are.

Mr. De La Cruz responded, per the current ordinance, corner properties are required to have a 10-foot landscape buffer in the front.

Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any further questions of Staff.

Ms. Velázquez noted the property owner and/or representative were *not* present.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if there was any further discussion amongst the Commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Brock, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez and UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE, WITH THE MODIFICATION, AS REQUESTED BY STAFF.

3. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. June 24, 2013 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the July 8, 2013 meeting. July 8, 2013 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the July 22, 2013 meeting.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if commissioners had any addresses they would like Staff to review or investigate. *There were none*.

HLC Staff Report

4. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Commissioner Helm AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW REPORT.

Other Business

5. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for June 10, 2013.

Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

SERVICE

SOLUTIONS

SUCCESS

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any additions/corrections/revisions. *There were none.*

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Helm, seconded by Commissioner Lopez and UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR JUNE 10, 2013.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 4:28 P.M.

Mayor Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3 Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6 Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7 Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland